# WORLD EMPLOYMENT AND SOCIAL OUTLOOK Trends for Women 2018 – Global snapshot

# Online appendices

# Appendix A. Country groupings by region and income level

### **Africa**

### Northern Africa

Algeria Egypt Libya Morocco Sudan Tunisia Western Sahara

#### Sub-Saharan Africa

Angola
Benin
Botswana
Burkina Faso
Burundi
Cameroon
Cabo Verde
Central African Republic

Chad Comoros Congo

Congo, Democratic Republic of the Côte d'Ivoire Djibouti Equatorial Guinea

Eritrea Ethiopia Gabon Gambia Ghana Guinea Guinea-Bissau Kenya Lesotho Liberia Madagascar Malawi Mali Mauritania Mauritius Mozambique Namibia

Namibia Niger Nigeria Rwanda Sao Tome

Sao Tome and Principe

Senegal Seychelles Sierra Leone Somalia South Africa South Sudan Swaziland

Tanzania, United Republic of

Togo Uganda Zambia Zimbabwe

### **Americas**

### Latin America and the Caribbean

Antigua and Barbuda Argentina Bahamas Barbados Belize

Bolivia, Plurinational State of

Brazil Chile Colombia Costa Rica Cuba

Dominican Republic

Ecuador
El Salvador
Grenada
Guatemala
Guyana
Haiti
Honduras
Jamaica
Mexico
Nicaragua
Panama
Paraguay
Peru
Puerto Rico

Saint Kitts and Nevis Saint Lucia Saint Vincent and the Grenadines Suriname

Trinidad and Tobago United States Virgin Islands Uruguay

Venezuela, Bolivarian Republic of

### Northern America

Canada United States

### **Arab States**

Yemen

Bahrain Iraq Jordan Kuwait Lebanon Occupied Palestinian Territory Oman Qatar Saudi Arabia Syrian Arab Republic United Arab Emirates

### **Asia and the Pacific**

#### Eastern Asia China

Hong Kong, China Japan

Korea, Democratic People's Republic of Korea, Republic of Macau, China Mongolia Taiwan, China

## South-Eastern Asia

### and the Pacific

Australia
Brunei Darussalam
Cambodia
Fiji
French Polynesia

Guam Indonesia Kiribati Lao People's

Democratic Republic

Malaysia

Marshall Islands

Micronesia, Federated States of

Myanmar Nauru New Caledonia New Zealand Palau Papua New Guinea

Philippines Samoa Singapore Solomon Islands Thailand Timor-Leste Tonga

Tuvalu Vanuatu Viet Nam Southern Asia Afghanistan Bangladesh Bhutan India

Iran, Islamic Republic of

Maldives Nepal Pakistan Sri Lanka

### **Europe and Central Asia**

# Northern, Southern and Western Europe

Albania Andorra Austria Belgium

Bosnia and Herzegovina Channel Islands

Croatia
Denmark
Estonia
Finland
France
Germany
Greece
Iceland
Ireland
Italy
Latvia
Liechtenstein
Lithuania

Luxembourg

Macedonia, the former

Yugoslav Republic of

Malta
Monaco
Montenegro
Netherlands
Norway
Portugal
Serbia
Slovenia
Spain
Sweden
Switzerland
United Kingdom

### Eastern Europe

Belarus
Bulgaria
Czech Republic
Hungary
Moldova, Republic of

Romania Russian Federation

Slovakia Ukraine

Poland

### **Central and Western Asia**

Armenia Azerbaijan Cyprus Georgia Israel Kazakhstan Kyrgyzstan Tajikistan Turkey Turkmenistan Uzbekistan

### **Developed countries**

Andorra

Antigua and Barbuda

Australia Austria Bahamas Bahrain Barbados Belgium

Brunei Darussalam

Canada Channel Islands

Chile Cyprus Czech Republic Denmark **Equatorial Guinea** 

Estonia Finland France

French Polynesia Germany Greece Guam

Hong Kong, China Hungary Iceland Ireland Israel Italy Japan

Korea, Republic of

Kuwait Latvia Liechtenstein Lithuania Luxembourg Macau, China Malta Monaco Netherlands New Caledonia New Zealand Norway Oman Poland Portugal

Puerto Rico

Qatar

Russian Federation Saint Kitts and Nevis Saudi Arabia Seychelles Singapore Slovakia Slovenia Spain Sweden Switzerland Taiwan, China Trinidad and Tobago United Arab Emirates

**United States** United States Virgin Islands

Uruguay

United Kingdom

### **Emerging countries** (Upper-middle income)

Albania Algeria Argentina Azerbaijan Belarus Belize

Bosnia and Herzegovina

Botswana Brazil Bulgaria China Colombia Costa Rica Croatia Cuba

Dominican Republic

Ecuador Fiji Gabon Grenada

Iran, Islamic Republic of

Iraq Jamaica Kazakhstan Lebanon Libya

Macedonia, the former Yugoslav

Republic of Malaysia Maldives Marshall Islands Mauritius Mexico Mongolia Montenegro Namibia Palau Panama

Paraguay Peru Romania Saint Lucia Saint Vincent and the Grenadines Serbia

South Africa Suriname Thailand Tonga Tunisia Turkev Turkmenistan Tuvalu

Venezuela, Bolivarian Republic of

### **Emerging countries** (Lower-middle income)

Angola Armenia Bangladesh Bhutan

Bolivia, Plurinational State of

Cameroon Cabo Verde Congo Côte d'Ivoire Djibouti Egypt El Salvador Georgia Ghana Guatemala Guyana Honduras India Indonesia Jordan Kenya Kiribati

Kyrgyzstan Lao People's Democratic

Republic Lesotho Mauritania

Micronesia, Federated States of Moldova, Republic of

Morocco Myanmar Nauru Nicaragua Nigeria

Occupied Palestinian Territory

Pakistan

Papua New Guinea Philippines Samoa

Sao Tome and Principe

Senegal Solomon Islands Sri Lanka Sudan Swaziland

Syrian Arab Republic

Tajikistan Timor-Leste Ukraine Uzbekistan Vanuatu Viet Nam Western Sahara

Yemen Zambia

### **Developing countries**

Afghanistan Benin Burkina Faso Burundi Cambodia

Central African Republic

Chad Comoros

Congo, Democratic Republic

of the Eritrea Ethiopia Gambia Guinea Guinea-Bissau Haiti

Korea, Democratic People's

Republic of Liberia Madagascar Malawi Mali Mozambique Nepal Niger Rwanda Sierra Leone Somalia South Sudan

Tanzania, United Republic of

Togo Uganda Zimbabwe

# Appendix B. Labour market estimates and projections

The source of all global and regional labour market estimates in this *World Employment and Social Outlook* report is the ILO's Trends Econometric Models (TEM), November 2017. The ILO has designed and actively maintains econometric models, which are used to produce estimates of labour market indicators in the countries and years for which country-reported data are unavailable. These allow the ILO to produce and analyse global and regional estimates of key labour market indicators and related trends.

The TEM is used to produce estimates and projections – disaggregated by age and sex as appropriate – of unemployment, employment and status in employment. The output of the model is a complete matrix of data for 189 countries. The country-level data can then be aggregated to produce regional and global estimates of labour market indicators, such as the unemployment rate and the employment-to-population ratio.

Prior to running the TEM, labour market information specialists in the Research Department, in cooperation with ILOSTAT and specialists in ILO field offices, evaluate existing country-reported data and select only those observations deemed sufficiently comparable across countries, using criteria including: (i) type of data source; (ii) geographic coverage; and (iii) age group coverage.

With regard to the first criterion, in order for data to be included in the model, they must be derived from either a labour force survey or a population census. National labour force surveys are generally similar across countries, and the data derived from these surveys are more readily comparable than data obtained from other sources. A strict preference is therefore given to labour force survey-based data in the selection process. However, many developing countries, which lack the resources to carry out a labour force survey, do report labour market information based on population censuses. Consequently, due to the need to balance the competing goals of data comparability and data coverage, some population census-based data are included in the model.

The second criterion is that only nationally representative (i.e. not prohibitively geographically limited) labour market indicators are included. Observations which correspond to only urban or only rural areas are not included, as large differences typically exist between rural and urban labour markets, and using only rural or urban data would not be consistent with benchmark data such as GDP.

The third criterion is that the age groups covered by the observed data must be sufficiently comparable across countries. Countries report labour market information for a variety of age groups and the age group selected can have an influence on the observed value of a given labour market indicator.

Apart from country-reported labour market information, the TEM uses the following benchmark files:

- United Nations World Population Prospects, 2017 Revision, for population estimates and projections:
- ILO Labour Force Estimates and Projections (LFEP), 2017 Revision, for labour force estimates and projections;
- IMF/World Bank data on GDP (PPP, per capita GDP and GDP growth rates) from the World Development Indicators and the World Economic Outlook database, October 2017;
- · World Bank poverty estimates from the PovcalNet database.

### **Estimates of labour market indicators**

The TEM produces estimates of unemployment rates to fill in missing values in the countries and years for which country-reported data are unavailable. Multivariate regressions are run separately for different regions in the world in which unemployment rates, broken down by age and sex (youth male, youth female, adult male, adult female), are regressed on GDP growth rates. Weights are used in the regressions to correct for biases that may result from the fact that countries which report unemployment rates tend to differ (in statistically important respects) from countries that do not report unemployment rates.

<sup>1.</sup> For instance, if simple averages of unemployment rates in reporting countries in a given region were used to estimate the unemployment rate in that region, and the countries that do not report unemployment rates should happen to differ from reporting countries with respect to unemployment rates, without such a correction mechanism the resulting estimated regional unemployment rate would be biased. The "weighted least squares" approach adopted in the TEM corrects for this potential problem.

For 2017, a preliminary estimate is produced, using quarterly and monthly information available up to the time of production of this *World Employment and Social Outlook* report (November 2017). The model also estimates employment by status using similar techniques to impute missing values at the country level. In addition to GDP growth rate, the variables used as explanatory variables are the value-added shares of the three broad sectors in GDP, per capita GDP and the share of people living in urban areas. Additional econometric models are used to produce global and regional estimates of working poverty and employment by economic class (Kapsos and Bourmpoula, 2013).

### **Projections of labour market indicators**

Unemployment rate projections are obtained using the historical relationship between unemployment rates and GDP growth during the worst crisis/downturn period for each country between 1991 and 2005, and during the corresponding recovery period.<sup>2</sup> This was done through the inclusion of interaction terms of crisis and recovery dummy variables with GDP growth in fixed effects panel regressions.<sup>3</sup> Specifically, the logistically transformed unemployment rate was regressed on a set of covariates, including the lagged unemployment rate, the GDP growth rate, the lagged GDP growth rate and a set of covariates consisting of the interaction of the crisis dummy and the interaction of the recovery-year dummy with each of the other variables.

Separate panel regressions were run across three different groupings of countries, based on:

- (1) geographic proximity and economic/institutional similarities;
- (2) income levels;4
- (3) level of export dependence (measured as exports as a percentage of GDP).<sup>5</sup>

The rationale behind these groupings is as follows: Countries within the same geographic area or with similar economic/institutional characteristics are likely to be similarly affected by the crisis and have similar mechanisms to attenuate the impact of the crisis on their labour markets. Furthermore, because countries within given geographic areas often have strong trade and financial linkages, the crisis is likely to spill over from one country to its neighbour (e.g. Canada's economy and labour market developments are intricately linked to developments in the United States). Countries with similar income levels are also likely to have similar labour market institutions (e.g. social protection measures) and similar capacities to implement fiscal stimulus and other policies to counter the crisis impact. Finally, as the decline in exports was the primary crisis transmission channel from developed to developing countries, countries were grouped according to their level of exposure to this channel, as measured by their exports as a percentage of GDP. The impact of the crisis on labour markets through the export channel also depends on the type of exports (the affected sectors of the economy) involved, the share of domestic value added in exports and the relative importance of domestic consumption (for instance, countries such as India and Indonesia, with a large domestic market, were less vulnerable than countries such as Singapore and Thailand). These characteristics are controlled for by using fixed effects in the regressions.

In addition to the panel regressions, country-level regressions were run for countries with sufficient data. The ordinary least squares country-level regressions included the same variables as the panel regressions.

<sup>2.</sup> The crisis period comprises the span between the year in which a country experienced the largest drop in GDP growth and the "turning point year" when growth reached its lowest level following the crisis before starting to climb back to its pre-crisis level. The recovery period comprises the years between the "turning point year" and the year when growth has returned to its pre-crisis level.

<sup>3.</sup> In order to project unemployment during the current recovery period, the crisis-year and recovery-year dummies were adjusted, based on the following definition: a country was considered to be "currently in crisis" if the drop in GDP growth after 2007 was larger than 75 per cent of the absolute value of the standard deviation of GDP growth over the 1991–2008 period and/or larger than 3 percentage points.

<sup>4.</sup> The income groups correspond to the World Bank income group classification of four income categories, based on countries' 2008 gross national income (GNI) per capita (calculated using the Atlas method): low-income countries, US\$975 or less; lower middle-income countries, US\$976–US\$3,855; upper middle-income countries, US\$3,856–US\$11,905; and high-income countries, US\$11,906 or more.

<sup>5.</sup> The export dependence-based groups are: highest exports (exports ≥ 70 per cent of GDP); high exports (exports <70 per cent but ≥50 per cent of GDP); medium exports (exports <50 per cent but ≥20 per cent of GDP); and low exports (exports <20 per cent of GDP).

To take into account the uncertainty surrounding GDP prospects, as well as the complexity of capturing the relationship between GDP and unemployment rates for all the countries, a variety of ten (similar) multilevel mixed-effects linear regressions (varying-intercept and varying-coefficient models) are utilized. The main component that changes across these ten versions is the lag structure of the independent variables. The potential superiority of these models lies in the fact that not only is the panel structure fully exploited (e.g. increased degrees of freedom), but it is also possible to estimate the coefficients specifically for each unit (country), taking into account unobserved heterogeneity at the cluster level and correcting for the random effects approach caveat that the independent variables are not correlated with the random effects term.

Overall, the final projection was generated as a simple average of the estimates obtained from the three group panel regressions and also, for countries with sufficient data, the country-level regressions. For a selection of countries (40 out of 189), an average of another set of forecast combinations was made according to a judgement-based appraisal in order to represent more realistically the recent trends observed in each country's economic forecast.

### Short-term projection model

For 41 countries, the preliminary unemployment estimate for 2017 and the projections for 2018 and 2019 are based on results from a country-specific short-term projection model. The ILO maintains a database on monthly and quarterly unemployment flows that contains information on inflow and outflow rates of unemployment, estimated on the basis of unemployment by duration, following the methodologies proposed by Shimer (2012) and Elsby, Hobijn and Sahin (2013). A multitude of models are specified that either project the unemployment rate directly or determine both inflow and outflow rates, using ARIMA, VARX and combined forecast techniques. The short-term projection model relies on several explanatory variables, including hiring uncertainty (Ernst and Viegelahn, 2014), policy uncertainty (Baker, Bloom and Davis, 2015), macroeconomic forecasts by Oxford Economics and the Manpower Employment Survey Outlook. All estimated models are evaluated on an eight-quarter ahead rolling pseudo out-of-sample forecasting evaluation starting in Q1 2009, among which five models are selected using a weighting of the mean and maximum forecast error. The top five model forecasts are then averaged.

### Sectoral employment estimates and projections

In addition to the labour market indicators mentioned above, this report also presents estimates and projections of the distribution of the employed population across sectors of economic activity. The main data source used for the estimation and projection of the employment shares by sector is the database on "Employment by sex and economic activity" available on ILOSTAT, which is complemented with data on sectoral employment from the OECD. To produce estimates and projections of sectoral employment shares, data on sectoral value added shares of GDP are taken from the United Nations Statistics Division - System of National Accounts - National Accounts Main Aggregates (UNSD SNAAMA, December 2016) database. The Economist Intelligence Unit (EIU) database was used to supplement the data from the above sources and also to assist in projecting the value added shares by sector. The demographic variables used in the model come from the United Nations World Population Prospects (UN WPP), the United Nations World Urbanization Prospects (UN WUP) and the ILO Labour Force Estimates and Projections (ILO LFEP). Other sources of data for explanatory variables are the IMF World Economic Outlook database, the World Bank World Development Indicators database and the IMF International Financial Statistics database. The explanatory variables that are considered include: GDP per capita, output per worker, investment, exports of goods, imports of goods, general government final consumption expenditure, gross capital formation, trade in services, real effective exchange rate index, value added by sector, ratio of female-to-male labour force aged 30 to 64 years old, share of urban population in total population, share of population aged less than 15 years old in total population, share of population aged less than 15 years old and population aged above 65 years old in total population, share of wage and salaried workers in total employment. Estimates and projections are produced on the basis of a methodology that proceeds in three steps: (i) run regressions with a set of different combinations of the potential explanatory variables; (ii) select the specifications for which the goodness-of-fit is best; and (iii) run a bootstrap procedure on those specifications and calculate for each geographical region and each sector the root mean square error (RMSE), based on this procedure. At this point, the RMSE is produced not only for these specifications but also for the average prediction among all the specifications selected, the average among the three best and among the five best performers. Then, for each sector or occupation and for each region, the specification with the lowest RMSE is selected to be used for the final estimates. Finally, some adjustments are made to the estimates in order to make sure that the sum of shares across all categories equals 100 and that the sum of men and women working in a specific sectoral equals the number of the estimate for both sexes.

Estimated sectors represent an ILO-specific classification that allows maximum consistency between the third and fourth revision of the International Standard of Industry Classification (ISIC). The sectors A, B, C, F, G, I, K, O, P and Q correspond to the ISIC Rev.4 classification. Furthermore, the following composite sectors are defined:

- "Utilities" is composed of sectors D and E
- "Transport, storage and communication" is composed of sectors H and J
- "Real estate, business and administrative activities" is composed of sectors L, M and N
- "Other services" is composed of sectors R, S and T.

#### References

- Baker, S.; Bloom, N.; Davis, S. 2015. *Measuring economic policy uncertainty*, Working Paper 21633, NBER Working Paper Series (Cambridge, MA, National Bureau of Economic Research (NBER)). Available at: www.policyuncertainty.com/media/BakerBloomDavis. pdf [27 Feb. 2018].
- Elsby, M.; Hobijn, B.; Sahin, A. 2013. "Unemployment dynamics in the OECD", in *Review of Economics and Statistics*, Vol. 95, No. 2, pp. 530–548.
- Ernst, E.; Viegelahn, C. 2014. *Hiring uncertainty: A new labour market indicator.* Available at: http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2411299 [27 Feb. 2018].
- Kapsos, S.; Bourmpoula, E. 2013. *Employment and economic class in the developing world,* ILO Research Paper No. 6 (Geneva, ILO). Available at: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---inst/documents/publication/wcms\_216451.pdf [20 Nov. 2017].
- Shimer, R. 2012. "Reassessing the ins and outs of unemployment", in *Review of Economic Dynamics*, Vol. 15, No. 2, pp. 127–148.